BEFORE

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF

SOUTH CAROLINA

Docket No. 2014-13-A

March 26, 2015

IN RE:	Application of Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC,)	
	a Subsidiary of EnergySolutions Company for)	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT
	Adjustment in the Levels of Allowable Costs)	(FOR FISCAL YEAR 2014-2015)
	and for Identification of Allowable Costs)	

This Settlement Agreement is made by and between Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC, a subsidiary of Energy Solutions Company ("Chem-Nuclear" or "Company") and the South Carolina Office of Regulatory Staff ("ORS") (collectively referred to as the "Parties") with respect to the Application and Amended Application of Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC, for Fiscal Year 2014-2015 ("Amended Application") pending before the Public Service Commission of South Carolina ("Commission") in Docket No. 2014-13-A.

WHEREAS, the Company filed an Application, dated September 26, 2014, ("Application") in this docket by which Chem-Nuclear requested the Commission to identify certain "allowable costs" for the Company's fiscal years 2013-2014 and 2014-2015, in accordance with the provisions of S.C. Code Ann. § 48-46-10, et seq. (Rev. 2008 & Supp. 2014), and with the Commission's rules and regulations; and

WHEREAS, ORS conducted an examination of the allowable costs to be identified and recovered in Chem-Nuclear's Application; and

WHEREAS, Chem-Nuclear filed an Amended Application, dated March 5, 2015 and a Second Amended Application, dated March 19, 2015, in this docket in accordance with S.C.

Code Ann. § 48-46-40(B)(4) (Rev. 2008 & Supp. 2014) and the Commission's rules and regulations; and

WHEREAS, the Company's Second Amended Application resolved the concerns of the ORS pursuant to its examination; and

WHEREAS, on March 19, 2015, the Prefiled Amended Direct Testimony of Michael J. Benjamin was filed on behalf of Chem-Nuclear reflecting the position of the Company as contained in its Second Amended Application; and

WHEREAS, the Report of ORS Auditor, Daniel Sullivan, of the review and examination of Chem-Nuclear's Application and Amended Application, dated March 11, 2015 ("Report"), is attached to this Agreement and incorporated by reference ("Attachment A"); and

WHEREAS such Report summarizes the Company's Amended Application and concurs with the request of the Company as contained in the Second Amended Application; and

WHEREAS, the Parties to this Agreement believe that it is in their best interests and those of the State of South Carolina to enter into a Settlement Agreement relating to this matter in order to avoid the additional expense which the litigation of their positions would occasion in this proceeding.

WHEREFORE, the Parties to this Agreement enter into it on the following terms:

- The Parties agree to the Actual Costs of Fiscal Year 2013-2014, including fixed costs, irregular costs, variable labor and non-labor costs and vault costs as specified in Chem-Nuclear's Amended Application.
- The Parties agree on the calculation of projected costs for Fiscal Year 2014-2015
 as specified in Chem-Nuclear's Second Amended Application.
- 3. The Parties agree that the Second Amended Application accurately reflects the

- agreed upon positions of the Company and ORS in this matter.
- 4. Chem-Nuclear agrees that Michael J. Benjamin will present testimony at the hearing in this matter consistent with his amended prefiled direct testimony, the Second Amended Application and the terms of this Settlement Agreement.
- 5. Upon execution of this Settlement Agreement, ORS will file an original of this Settlement Agreement with the Commission and serve a copy of it upon all parties of record in Commission Docket No. 2014-13-A.
- 6. The Parties agree that by signing this Settlement Agreement, it will not constrain, inhibit or impair in any way their arguments or positions they may choose to take in future proceedings. If the Commission should decline to approve the Settlement Agreement in its entirety, then any or all of the Parties may withdraw from the Settlement Agreement without prejudice.
- 7. This Settlement Agreement shall be interpreted according to South Carolina law.
- 8. The Parties acknowledge their consent and agreement to the terms of this Settlement Agreement by authorizing their respective counsel to affix his or her signature to this document where indicated below. Counsel's signature constitutes a representation that his or her client has authorized the execution of this Settlement Agreement. Facsimile signatures and email signatures shall be as effective as original signatures. This document may be signed in counterparts, with the various signature pages combined with the body of the document constituting an original and provable copy of this Settlement Agreement.

Representing and binding the Office of Regulatory Staff:

Jeffrey M. Nelson, Esquire Andrew M. Bateman, Esquire Office of Regulatory Staff

1401 Main Street, Suite 900

Columbia, South Carolina 29201

Phone: (803) 737-0823 Fax: (803) 737-0895

Email: jnelson@regstaff.sc.gov

March _______, 2015

Representing and binding Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC, a Subsidiary of Energy Solutions Co.:

J. David Black, Esquire Sara S. Rogers, Esquire Nexsen Pruet, LLC Post Office Box 2426 Columbia, SC 29202 Phone: (803) 771-8900

Fax: (803) 253-8277

Email: <u>srogers@nexsenpruet.com</u> <u>dblack@nexsenpruet.com</u>

March 26, 2015



SOUTH CAROLINA OFFICE OF REGULATORY STAFF

EXAMINATION REPORT FOR DOCKET NO. 2014-13-A

THE APPLICATION OF CHEM-NUCLEAR SYSTEMS, LLC, A SUBSIDIARY OF ENERGYSOLUTIONS COMPANY, FOR ADJUSTMENT IN THE LEVELS OF ALLOWABLE COSTS AND FOR IDENTIFICATION OF ALLOWABLE COSTS

On September 26, 2014, Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC ("Chem-Nuclear") filed an application for Adjustment in the Levels of Allowable Costs for the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2014 and for Identification of Allowable Costs for the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2015, pursuant to Public Service Commission of South Carolina ("PSC" or "Commission") Order No. 2014-451 in Docket No. 2013-13-A.

Effective July 1, 2008, Pursuant to S.C. Code Ann. § 48-46-40 (A)(6)(a), (Rev. 2008 & Supp. 2014), Chem-Nuclear can only accept waste generated within the three Atlantic Compact states, South Carolina, New Jersey and Connecticut. Additionally, since July 1, 2008, Chem-Nuclear commenced site closure ("institutional") activities parallel to its site disposal operating ("operational") activities. These institutional costs include site maintenance, monitoring, security, other administrative expenses and license costs, and are paid from the Barnwell Decommissioning Trust Fund each year. Remaining reimbursable costs are included as operating costs in Chem-Nuclear's application for reimbursement filed with the Public Service Commission.

The South Carolina Office of Regulatory Staff ("ORS") completed an examination of the application and the underlying financial records of Chem-Nuclear for the operation of its regional low-level radioactive waste disposal facility located in the vicinity of Barnwell, South Carolina. Based on this examination, ORS recommended adjustments to Chem-Nuclear's Fixed costs, Variable costs and Irregular costs for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2014. These adjustments were discussed with members of Chem-Nuclear's management who agreed with the propriety of the adjustments.

A comparison of the allowable reimbursable costs to the amounts authorized by the PSC in Order No. 2014-451 dated June 3, 2014, was prepared by ORS Audit Staff. This comparison is attached herewith as Exhibit A. As shown on Exhibit A, ORS recommends that Chem-Nuclear

be allowed to retain, as recovery of their expenditures in operating the Barnwell Low Level Radioactive Waste Storage Facility for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2013, the following:

- \$ 3,387,466 in Fixed Costs
- \$ 388,391 in Variable Costs
- \$ 225,550 in Irregular Costs

In conjunction with procedures performed for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2014, ORS also examined transactions recorded by Chem-Nuclear for the period beginning July 1, 2014, and extending through December 31, 2014. Based on this examination, ORS recommended adjustments to Chem-Nuclear's Projected Fixed and Irregular costs for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2015, as listed in Exhibit AA. These adjustments were discussed with members of Chem-Nuclear's management who agreed with their propriety.

Daniel F. Sullivan, Senior Audit Manager

March 19, 2015

Tand F. Soller

Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC Operating Experience and Reimbursable Costs For the Twelve Months Ended June 30, 2014

Exhibit A
Page 1 of 2

	Per Amended Application		Commission Order No. 2014- 451		Actual Costs Over (Under) Commission Allowed	
Fixed Costs						
Labor, Fringe and Non-Labor	\$	2,090,975	\$	2,075,258	\$	15,717
Corporate Allocations (G&A)		623,873		590,777		33,096
Equipment Leases and Support		189,790		191,200		(1,410)
Depreciation		73,870		76,972		(3,102)
Insurance		375,141		352,509		22,632
Legal (License Appeal)		33,817		33,016		801
Total Fixed Costs	\$	3,387,466	\$	3,319,732	\$	67,734
Yariable Costs						
Vault Cost	\$	156,249	\$	352,518	\$	(196,269)
Labor and Non-Labor Costs		232,142		164,479		67,663
Total Variable Costs		388,391	\$	516,997	<u> </u>	(128,606)

Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC Operating Experience and Reimbursable Costs For the Twelve Months Ended June 30, 2014

Exhibit A
Page 2 of 2
Actual Costs
Over (Index)

	Per Amended Application	Commission Order No. 2014- 451	Over (Under) Commission Allowed	
Irregular Costs				
Various Trenches (Design, Construct, and Backfill)				
Labor	14,322			
Non-Labor	35,475			
Total	\$ 49,797	\$ 96,250	\$ (46,453)	
License Renewal and Appeal Costs				
Labor	•			
Non-Labor	-			
Total	-	10,000	(10,000)	
Decontamination & Corrective Actions				
Labor	1,289			
Non-Labor				
Total	1,320	5,000	(3,680)	
Manage A. Manage A. M. M. Manage A. M.			(3,000)	
Trench Records Software				
Labor	669	23		
Non-Labor	3,816			
Total	4,485	-	4,485	
Site Assessments				
Labor	-			
Non-Labor	-			
Total	-	5,000	(5,000)	
Site Maintenance			-	
Labor	28,351			
Non-Labor	75,867			
Total	104,218		104,218	
Site Producedness and December 11 dates				
Site Engineering and Drawing Updates Labor				
Non-Labor	224			
Total	311			
Total	535	97,000	(96,465)	
Other Irregular Costs				
Labor	(2)			
Non-Labor				
Total	(2)		(2)	
Severance/Incentive			.—	
Labor	65,197			
Non-Labor	-			
Total	65,197	-	65,197	
Missellensons	1			
Miscellaneous Labor				
73. 10	•			
Non-Labor	*			
Total	•	20,000	(20,000)	
Total Irregular Costs	\$ 225,550	\$ 233,250	\$ (7,700)	
			The second second	

Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC Proposed Fixed, Irregular and Variable Costs For the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2015 To Date

Exhibit AA
Page 1 of 2

		Per Amended Application		Actual Through 12/31/2014	<u>.</u> .	Difference
FD	ŒD C	COSTS				
Fixed Costs to which 29% operating margin is added:						
Labor, Fringe and Non-Labor	\$	2,147,489	S	1,049,180	2	1,098,309
Corporate Allocations (Management Fees/G&A)		629,865		297,309	•	332,556
Depreciation		112,578		53,534		59,044
Insurance		366,252		115,388		250,864
Equipment Leases and Support		297,983		189,554		108,429
Total Margin Costs		3,554,167	_	1,704,965	· -	1,849,202
Fixed Costs to which 29% operating margin is not added	d:					
Legal Support (license appeal)		150,000		68,451		81,549
Total Non-margin Costs		150,000	_	68,451	_	81,549
Total Fixed Costs	\$	3,704,167	\$	1,773,416	\$ _	1,930,751
IRREG	<u>ULAI</u>	R COSTS				
Trench Construction	\$	150,000	\$	18,721	\$	131,279
License Appeal		300,000		142,827		157,173
Corrective Action		2,000		352		1,648
Trench Software		5,000		2,185		2,815
Site Engineering Drawings		1,000		473		527
Site Maintenance		50,000		2,830		47,170
Severance/Incentive	-	12,369	-	12,369	_	
Total Irregular Costs	\$.	520,369	\$	179,757	\$ _	340,612

Chem-Nuclear Systems, LLC Proposed Fixed, Irregular and Variable Costs For the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2015 To Date

Exhibit AA
Page 2 of 2

VARIABLE RATES

		Costs	Variable Factor		
Variable Labor and Non-Labor Rates Vault Purchase & Inspection	s	347.79	Per Vault		
ABC Waste Disposal	\$	2,420.16	Per Shipment		
Slit Trench Shipment	\$	38,464.87	Per Offload		
Customer Assistance	\$	121.77	Per Shipment		
Trench Records	\$	366.31	Per Container		
Variable Material Cost Rates (Vaults) Class A Waste	\$	35.20	Per Cubic Foot		
Class B Waste	s	48.16	Per Cubic Foot		
Class C Waste	s	57.56	Per Cubic Foot		
Slit Trench Waste	\$	153.18	Per Cubic Foot		